

Hassan al-Turabi's Discourse on the Arts: Conservative Prohibition and Cautious Permission

Gubara Said Hassan and Jabal M. Buaben

Abstract

In Islam, God's wondrous creativity is reflected in the unity of design in the widest diversity and beauty of the cosmos. For some Muslims, Islamic art expresses this natural beauty as well as the miracles of God's creation related in the Qur'an and the prophetic traditions (*aḥādīth*). This article focuses on Hassan al-Turabi's perceptions of the arts and the aura of conservative prohibition and cautious permission that surrounds them. For him, the Islamic attitude toward the arts and aesthetics is determined by monotheism (*tawḥīd*), which entails one's absolute belief in God's oneness and the abjuration of anything that might compete with it or with His omnipotence. God has created in beauty a dualistic nature: guidance (belief and faith) and temptation (seduction and aberration) for humanity.

Keywords: Arabia, tribalism, Arabic poetry, idols, beauty, painting, pictorial and figurative arts, calligraphy, sculpture, architecture, music, singing, dance

Introduction

In his *History of the Arabs*, Philip K. Hitti stated that "it was only in the field of poetical expression that the pre-Islamic Arabian excelled. Herein his finest talents found a field. The Bedouin's love for poetry was his one cultural asset."¹ The abundant remains of that desert art, according to A. J. Arberry, "developed an unparalleled poetic structure which still astounds scholars."² The Bedouin poet (*shā'ir*) was the oracle of his tribal group, its guide in peace negotiations and arbitration, and its instigator in times of war

Gubara Said Hassan, originally from Sudan, teaches international relations, globalization, as well as global development and governance, at the Institute of Policy Studies, Universiti Brunei Darussalam. He is also an adjunct professor at the Institute of African Studies, Carleton University, Canada. Jabal M. Buaben, formerly of the School of Philosophy, Theology, and Religion, University of Birmingham, UK, is an associate professor of Islamic history and civilization at the Sultan Omar Ali Saifuddin Centre for Islamic Studies, Universiti Brunei Darussalam.

and conflict. However, as this term implies, the poet was commonly believed to be endowed with supernatural knowledge, a wizard who had some kind of relationship with the spirits or devils, and one who depended upon them for his or her magical powers. Apart from poetry, however, which these Arabs held up as being the supreme expression of literary or artistic excellence and thus accorded their poets an influential tribal position, they "had little or no erudition in the arts and most of their acclaimed artistic expressions had their origins from foreign lands."³ Clearly, the nomadic life of continuous wandering, along with tribal warfare and conflict, was not conducive to painting and sculpture.

For Thomas W. Arnold, "the gods [and goddesses] of the Arabs at the period of the birth of Muhammad received little in the way of artistic treatment, for the Arabs at this period seem to have been content with shapeless blocks of stone (and wood) as symbols of the divinities they worshipped, and whenever they did spend any artistic effort upon them, it was of a meagre character."⁴ In this sense, one could state that Prophet Muhammad received a heritage devoid of any noteworthy art, a reality that is reflected in his attitude toward the arts through the Qur'an, the Sunnah, and his personal life.

As the Arabs poured out of the desert during the seventh century, they conquered cultures that were new to them. In the Roman and Persian empires, for example, they found gratification in painting and in other novel artistic experiences that appealed to them due to the pagan spirit that still animated many of them. Their invasion of Syria, Persia, Egypt, North Africa, and Spain (Andalusia) brought them into contact with peoples that had inherited ancient artistic traditions. The new Muslim rulers soon learned to appreciate their subjects' artistic abilities not only in forms that were harmonious with Islam, but also in ways directly opposed to its teachings. Once again, devoid of any creative artistic activity of their own, the early Muslim Arabs had to seek the help of others. Therefore, the beginnings of what is commonly known as the Arab/Muslim arts are of foreign origin.

Arnold identifies the various non-Arabs and non-Muslims involved in the prolific display of artistic production in the era of Islamic rule. He counts among these the Christians from the lands that had come under Islamic sway, the Persians for whom artistic expressions were part of their culture; the Manicheans, for whom religious art was important, also contributed to this heritage. The fourth group he identifies as the cultures of Transoxania who had well-developed artistic expressions before they came under Islamic sovereignty.⁵ Islam, of course, made its own immense imprint on these "imported" artistic expressions and adapted them to reflect its core philosophy of this world and the hereafter, as well as its attitude toward the arts and aesthetics.

Hassan al-Turabi (b. 1932) believes that the Islamic attitude toward the arts and aesthetics is determined by monotheism (*tawhīd*), which entails a complete submission to the belief in God's oneness and abjuration of anything that might compete with it or with His omnipotence, as well as a belief in His wondrous creativity as reflected in the unity of design in the widest diversity and beauty of the cosmos. Islamic art, whether architecture, painting, or sculpture, expresses both this natural beauty and the miracles of God's creation:

That which is on Earth We have made but as a glittering show for it, in order that We may test them – as to which of them are best in conduct. (Q. 18:7)

We have indeed decked the lower heaven with beauty (in) the stars. (Q 37:6)

It is We who have set out constellations in the heavens and made them fair-seeming to all beholders. (Q. 15:16)

Or who has created the heavens and Earth, and who sends you down rain from the sky? Yea, with it We caused to grow well-panted orchards full of beauty and delight: it is not in your power to cause the growth of the trees in them. (Can there be another) deity beside Allah? Nay, they are people who swerve from justice. (Q. 27:60)

“Forms of beauty in the present visible cosmos,” al-Turabi states, “attract beholders and thinkers and transcend matter only to acquaint them with God and His attributes of perfection, wisdom and creativity.”⁶ Thus how can anyone think of the wonderful universe as a whole without thinking of the far higher unity of design, the evidence of God? The highest lessons we can draw from this order, beauty, and grandeur are spiritual: The author of this marvelous order, beauty, and harmony is One, and He alone is entitled to sincere worship or devotion, the reward of which is eternal residence in an extensive and beautiful Paradise. He continues, “The creation of beauty may accompany the most significant objective of religion, belief in God as One. A believer can express his [or her] intentions and psychological states or conditions through (artistic) forms that transform theoretical values into a living, realistic, beautiful and effective example. Such an example will make these intentions and states a perfect emotional experience and a comprehensive reaction.”⁷

Al-Turabi grounds his argument on the Qur'an, which states: “Say: ‘Truly, my prayer, and my service of sacrifice, my life and my death, are (all) for Allah, the Cherisher of the Worlds’” (Q. 6:162). In this respect asceticism, which often means negating or renouncing materialistic pleasures, has no necessary sanctity attached to it. The beautiful and good things of life are really meant for and should be the privilege of those with faith in Allah. One is

cautioned against the assumption often held by many religious scholars that those who do not follow precisely what the Creator has ordered would have no stake in what this world offers. He points [out] that such people would have adequate benefit and be given the opportunity to amend their way on earth while facing accountability at the end of time.⁸

According to al-Turabi, God created in beauty a dualistic nature: guidance (belief and faith) and temptation (seduction and aberration) for humanity.

Since art is a symbolic practice that indicates an aesthetic ideal, interacts with the artist's imagination and transcends his [or her] direct reality, and since religion is also a symbolic practice that interacts with the unknown, transcends mundane life and aspires for eternity, art is relevant to religion and both of them can live in harmony. The artist can be guided by faith (*īmān*) which in turn gives him [or her] more inspiration (*ilhām*) for more artistic production.⁹

In other words, religiosity gives artists a spiritual supply for an intensive symbolism. It enriches their imagination, enables their aspirations, develops their fortitude in facing life's afflictions and challenges, and enriches their souls through reactions of faith, the changing conditions of life, and the tensions that arise. It is religion alone that that makes artists commit themselves to this transitional life and the permanent hereafter. Art should be adopted as a means of worshipping God. A historical religious example of this is Prophet David, whose gifts of song and sacred music were displayed in his psalms, where all of nature sings and echoes the praise of God: "We bestowed grace aforetime on David from Us. O you mountains, echo the praises of Allah with him! And you birds (also)!" (Q. 34:10).

Al-Turabi characterizes art in the following statement: "Like authority, economics and sex, [it] attracts through lust, overwhelms or dazzles man and captivates him. If the world of art, as expressed by the slogan 'art for art's sake,' engulfs man he will then experience real polytheism (*shirk*). Beauty will then become a deity or divinity worshipped by man or an end in itself or dominate all other values of life and abrogate all moral values."¹⁰ Furthermore,

art is a free, unlimited emotional or sentimental reaction that does not suit the reasonable or rational orientation and conscious movement towards God (Allah). It is a satisfaction of obscure psychological needs. It draws man into imagination and distracts him from all serious objectives. It is in close association with the artist's soul and personal conditions and far from being an objective system or social function that is committed to public interests or the needs of a reality."¹¹

In and of themselves, the arts are not evil and may in fact serve religion and righteousness, but there is a danger that they may be prostituted for base purposes. If the arts are insincere or divorced from actual life, or from its goodness or its serious objectives, they may become instruments of evil or futility, diverting one's attention from all set purposes and causing one to seek the depth of human folly rather than the height of divine light. Thus the commendable arts emanate from minds and souls steeped in faith, try to carry out in life the fine sentiments they express in their artistic works, and seek the glory of God rather than self-glorification or the fulsome praise of others and transitory pleasures.

In this sense, perfect artists should be perfectly faithful individuals. Life is taken seriously by those faithful individuals who realize what hangs upon it. But as the Qur'an indicates, frivolous people, such as poets, prefer the vanities of life and idle distractions to true realities.

And the poets, it is those straying in evil who follow them: do you not see that they wander distracted in every valley? And that they say what they practise not? Except those who believe, work righteousness, engaged much in the remembrance of Allah, and defend themselves after they are unjustly attacked. (Q. 26:224-27)

But there are, among men [and women], those who purchase idle tales without knowledge (or meaning), to mislead (people) from the path of God and throw ridicule (on it): for such there will be a humiliating chastisement. (Q. 31:6)

It is religion that commits artists to the seriousness of the mundane life and the expectations of the hereafter. Art should be used as a means of devotion to God and practiced according to the teachings of the Qur'an and Sunnah.

For al-Turabi, in principle "art, which enhances one's profound acknowledgement of the beauty in Allah's creation, does not clash with the *tawhidic* paradigm and the Sunnah of Prophet Muhammad."¹² The Qur'an, as the ultimate expression of the divine in Islam, was revealed in Arabic, resides in unmatched linguistic beauty, and is armed with unprecedented linguistic efficacy. The divine message of Islam, delivered through the Prophet, laid the foundation for the high intellectual and emotional esteem in which the Qur'an has been held ever since. This attitude has resulted in two major developments: calligraphy (i.e., writing the Qur'anic text in a manner compatible with its sacred status) and the love of knowledge and the propagation of books as the medium of knowledge.

As Arnold intimates, calligraphy or the

art of writing is an honourable one and a soul-nourishing accomplishment. As a manual attainment it is always elegant, and enjoys general approval, is respected in every land, and rises to eminence and wins the confidence of every class, being always held to be of high rank and dignity, oppression cannot touch it, and it is held in remembrance in every country, and every wall is adorned by its hand."¹³

Calligraphy enjoys an exalted position in the Muslim world due to its connection with the Word of God and with all of His prophets. This profession was one of honor and dignity, for it engaged the person in writing and copying the Qur'an and thus was accorded religious sanction. This consideration shows the different status of calligraphers, whose work was in the service of Islam, and of painters and sculptors, whose works were condemned. This lack of religious sanction also lowered the status of singers, dancers, sculptors, and painters. In addition,

for of the three great missionary religions of the world – Buddhism, Christianity and Islam – each striving for the mastery of the world and endeavouring to win the allegiance of all men [and women] by various devices of propaganda, Islam alone has refused to call in the aid of pictorial art as a handmaid to religion. This hostile attitude on the part of Islam to pictorial art has given to the whole history of its propaganda, and to the organization of its devout life, a complexion fundamentally different from that of either Buddhism or Christianity, both of which have made use of paintings in order to attract fresh converts or to instruct and edify the faithful.¹⁴

This theological objection has applied from Islam's early period and has effectively prevented the emergence of painting and sculpture in its followers' religious life. It has sometimes been stated that the Qur'an forbids the painting of pictures and sculpture, even though it contains no specific mention of pictures. Only Q. 5:90, which the theologians would cite to support this particular prohibition, makes it clear that the real objective was avoiding idolatry: "O you who believe! Intoxicants and gambling, sacrificing to stones and divination by arrows are an abomination of Satan's handiwork: eschew such abomination that you may prosper." The legal basis of condemning and prohibiting pictorial and figurative art must therefore be sought in the prophetic traditions.

A clearer pronouncement in this regard is found in this literature, which sanctions the hostile attitude prevailing at that time throughout the Muslim world. These traditions enjoy the same status as due the verses of the Qur'an in terms of formulating Islamic dogma; however, Muslim jurists hold that they proceed from divine inspirations, unlike the Qur'an, and are inspired only in terms of their content and meaning, and not in terms of their actual verbal ex-

pression. Accordingly, their authority is commensurate with that of the Qur'an's precepts and thus equally binding on the Muslims' conscience.

The prophetic traditions condemn painting and figurative art or sculpture. In fact, al-Bukhari reports that the Prophet said that painters will be most severely punished on the Day of Judgment, will experience the punishment of Hell, and will be called to breathe life into the forms they have fashioned. He issued this statement for two reasons: (1) Painters and sculptors usurp God's creative function by fashioning the form of a living being and thus are attempting to assimilate themselves to God. God will command them to breathe life into what they have created, something that they of course cannot do, and thus they will be tortured in the Fire and (2) His intention was to wipe paganism from the Arabs' memory. Succeeding Muslim generations relate that after the Prophet peacefully conquered and then entered Makkah, he went into the Ka'bah and ordered the pictures in it to be obliterated and the idols surrounding it to be destroyed.

In any case, Muslim exegetes generally rejected any views that permitted the figurative arts (*taṣwīr*) on the grounds that any supposed permission found in the Qur'an was voided by the prophetic traditions. Still, even this prohibition (*taḥrīm*) was not unanimous when it came to subsidiary issues, particularly on how one should regard figures printed on garments, bedclothes, and curtains; drawing plants; and the production of all kinds of art for secular purposes. However, Arnold argues that "later, after the Hijrah, when *aḥādīth* received statutory recognition, painting and sculpture became forbidden as in the authoritative *aḥādīth* collections and the prohibition became enshrined in Muslim legal texts."¹⁵

Al-Turabi appears to be undisturbed by the conservative Islamic legal provisions on the prohibition of figurative art. For him,

the triumph of the conservative tendency toward arts can be attributed not to a mere inquiry into the narrated Shari'ah texts but to historical considerations. [Primarily], ... since the Arabian Peninsula was relatively devoid of cultural elements other than poetry, artistic phenomena in the life of post-Prophetic Muslims were foreign importations. The new varieties of arts generated after the Islamic conquests, which brought Muslims into contact with races that had inherited an ancient artistic tradition, were rejected by Muslim jurists who also doubted all cultural imports including scholastic theology (*kalām*).¹⁶

He goes on to enumerate other factors, including "the alleged negative effects of the arts on spirituality and life hence leading people to be over cautious and also the general inflexible attitudes of Islamic jurists (*fuqahā'*)."¹⁷ In addition, Islamic jurisprudence sticks to the texts and does not consider the

fact that the Prophet approved of dolls and the figures of people and animals on the woven stuffs with which his house in Madinah was decorated, so long as they did not distract his attention when he was praying. Similarly, the prophetic prohibition of painting was intended to avoid idolatry and any deviation from absolute loyalty to the sole true deity: God.

The practical acceptance of this ruling, which was a common ummah-wide theological opinion, largely depended upon the theologians' influence upon the habits and tastes of society at a particular time. Such a stern and uncompromising opinion can, on occasion, relax some of its severity depending as regards the prevailing conventions and the intentions of the artists and those who view their works. Rapture (*tarab*) is an affair of the Sunnah, and therefore the prophetic traditions relevant to it and to weddings, arrival from abroad, and festivities were not restricted. Prohibiting rapture is applicable only when such events are accompanied by drinking wine and engaging in immoral activities.

Building on this relaxed religious attitude, al-Turabi states that "creating beauty can and should be cautiously utilized for worship of God. Such caution is caused by the alluring nature of the arts, the conservative religious attitude toward artistic production and the threat of imported Western culture which increases such temptation through exposure to an alluring, ignorant (*jāhili*) arts."¹⁸ In addition, the quest for beauty and its creation is, in principle, encouraged by the traditions and teachings of the Shari'ah as an inquiry into God's cosmic signs, gratitude for His beautiful favors, an expression of and an adornment of worship, and a permitted distraction or psychological relaxation for better devotion.

However, he emphasizes that in accordance with Islam's general ethical and theological principles, any art that challenges the *tawhidic* paradigm and promotes immorality, tyranny, and dishonesty in any form should be prohibited.¹⁹ But if they consider what he calls "the religious confines of prohibition and abhorrence," then they are permitted. In this respect, he accepts and prefers the following varieties of colorful figurative art to persons, materials, and scenes: calligraphy; beautiful lyrical, theatrical, and epic poetry; and narratives and prose – as long as they do not contain anything prohibited. Aural and visible art, expressed by music, dancing, and song, is permitted unless it leads to immorality. Purposeful performing art (e.g., theater, cinema, and television), applied art (e.g., adornments in jewelry and clothes), industrial and architectural design, or commercial advertising are also permitted according to the same reasoning.²⁰

Al-Turabi justifies his preference and acceptance of these arts, for

the significant role played by arts in contemporary social life is an outcome of the dominance of the patterns of Western civilization and the efficacy of the modern communication revolution and its technology. In addition, since Divine religious messages call for devotion to God, to fight against evil and strive for good ends, arts should be utilized to realize such ends.²¹

In other words, art and modern international civilization play a great role in the call toward doctrines and values. A call through artistic beautify is tantamount to a direct call through oral and written discourse. Thus, famous Islamic stories, plays, films, and poems are very significant in propagating the Islamic message worldwide.

He also draws attention to the role of the arts in the stages of what he calls "Islamic construction," including calling others to Islam (*da'wah*), struggle (jihad), social transformation, and stability. Moreover, performing and literary artistic expression can facilitate effective criticism of existing social conditions, expose the deficiencies of the status quo, and help people aspire for better alternatives. As he puts it:

In the stage of jihad (struggle) and revolution against an old system of values, artists and men of literature can play a colossal role in agitation and mobilization and in keeping the revolutionary rhythm active through poetry and hymns. Popular arts also have their special role in the psychological concentration of victorious post-revolutionary values and the reception of the new order. It is imperative that artists and men of literature should recognize their active role in Islamic Jihad and that the perfection of Jihad entails the consecration of all artistic potential for God's path.²²

In the stage of the call and jihad for propagating and defending Islam, priority should be given to general issues, criticism of the old regime's fundamentals, and concentration on those pertaining to the new Islamic order. Poetry, plays, and films can be very useful here, for their styles have the ability to carry messages related to public life, represent collective consciousness, and express the comparison between conflicting lifestyles. During the third stage, that of social transformation, artistic expression can convey the underlying motives of the new message or mission. But when the new order is settled and psychologically established, the artistic renewal should accelerate its pace in order to assimilate new values and fill the vacuum created by the destruction of all expressions of the former order of things. The arts should be used for both deconstruction and reconstruction, for they "could help in enhancing one's religious life, enabling creativity and introducing dynamism in the general life of a Muslim. Therefore they need to be promoted."²³

Among the most important problems that challenge the arts in their aspiration to accomplish an Islamic transformation, al-Turabi mentions the influence of the arts in the spiritual and mundane life of a Muslim which creates a sort of dualism, the potential conflict with the *tawhidic* paradigm and the rigid jurisprudence (*fiqh*). In addition, he refers to the pragmatic problems of post-modern culture, issues of pre-Islamic ideas and also the overwhelming influence of Western culture.

In his attempt to handle these problems, al-Turabi offers several solutions:

First, the necessity for an authentic, faithful artistic education guided by an Islamic behavioural method that places this education in the sphere of religiousness. Second, the perfection of religion through an original legal *ijtihād* (rational reasoning) that depicts a straight path to arts and appreciates the value of artistic works in the light of Shari'ah values. Third, both the Muslim artist and the Islamic artistic movement should have intellectual and spiritual authentication and a practical orientation to build a new model for the unity of religion and the arts. Fourth, the vanguard of the Islamic movement should acquire a supply of suitable faith and legislation, be empowered by their faith to challenge discouragement, tribulation (*fitnah*) and should create the model of a "faithful" art. Fifth, policies which create an atmosphere conducive to the Islamic artistic movement through the provision of facilities and freedom. Sixth, state control and censorship over the means of communication assist faith, the faithful and the emergence of a religious artistic movement parallel to the explosive phenomena of religiousness in the life of Muslims.

Seventh, since a comprehensive monotheistic Islamic life is a perfect, continuous system, a renaissance in Islamic art is unattainable without a renaissance in all Muslims' affairs. Eighth, the renewal of all Islamic jurisprudence, including that of art, through comprehensive *ijtihād* (rational reasoning). Ninth, the provision of a multitude of cultural symbols in a life rich in forms and stimuli interacts with world culture and benefits from styles of human artistic creativity without having its identity deformed and conscience obliterated. Tenth, an artist should be religiously committed and concerned with all aspects of life. Those who lead "our" artistic renaissance should be faithful, have genuine motives and should guide people through their vocation and good example. To these are added, their God-fearing, observance of religious rituals and having solidarity with all aspirants for an Islamic order where a policy of artistic liberation can be adopted for the sake of beauty and creativity."²⁵

Conclusion

To conclude, Islam's hatred of idolatry caused a statue or a picture to be regarded with suspicion because it might play a role in leading the faithful into

heresy and polytheism. However, this hostile attitude has not kept paintings, statues of heroes, songs, and dancing entirely out of the public religious life of Islam and from most Muslim societies. Similarly, the Muslim world contains plenty of kings or sultans, nobles and princes, not to mention military rulers, many of whom, despite their general fidelity to Islamic dogma, have unhesitatingly disregarded the jurists' protest whenever they feel that it is their best interests do so. Wine is explicitly prohibited in the Qur'an and the prophetic traditions, and yet all of Islamic history and literature is full of drinking, dancing, and concubines – all of which poets, particularly those of the kings, have praised. The jurists sternly condemned music, but Arabic literature is full of stories of musicians and singers – as well as of the liberal patronage bestowed upon them by Muslim princes. In many other respects the practice of the royals and other prominent people was and remains contrary to the precepts of Islamic traditions. In almost every Muslim country sultans and kings have sought to leave behind some memorial of themselves in the form of statues, tombs, or paintings.

Another interesting example is the Islamic world's failure to break with the past and establish a culture permeated with Islam's spirit. In the Arab and Muslim worlds, pre-Islamic poetry is still held up as the supreme literary excellence and, consequently, has been diligently studied throughout the Muslim era, even though in sentiment and ideals it is the very antithesis of the Prophet's teachings. Young Muslim students read and study these poems that are full of the spirit of self-gratification, licentiousness, wine, and other forms of self-indulgence. Due to this, as well as to foreign invasion and acculturation, there has always been an internal contradiction between the Islamic ideals of asceticism, humility, self-depreciation, and piety and those of pride, lust, and the joy of life, each of which are set forth in the literature and simultaneously admired by the jurists.

Added to this has been the widespread self-assertiveness of the wealthy and powerful who ride rough-shod over the dogmatists and moralists. The jurists have not succeeded in imposing their viewpoint upon Muslims, and Islamic history reveals that Muslim rulers often flouted the former's authority. However, they still have enough influence to exclude sculptures from the mosque, which is devoted to religious purposes, and to keep the general body of orthodox believers uncontaminated by such abominations.

Al-Turabi did present a legal defense of the arts, one based on various justifications and his apparent belief that artists have quite peculiar means of recognizing God. According to him, painters who sketch anything that has life must come to feel that they cannot bestow individuality upon their creations and thus are forced to think of God, the Creator of life, and to increase their knowledge of Him and their own faith. This defense obviously has in mind the

condemnation embodied in the prophetic traditions and attempts to refute them on the grounds that painting and sculpture could advance divine knowledge and faith. It is characteristic of him that, during this period, this new appreciation of the arts or beauty and its creation should find its expression in the language of jurisprudence and seek to confute, through *ijtihad*, the unfavorable judgment and hostility of the older Islamic jurists with their own weapon. However, this new Turabist appreciation of the arts never managed to displace the earlier condemnation, for the latter was too firmly rooted in popular Islamic sentiment and too decisively set forth in authoritative classical-era legal textbooks to make way for more modern speculations.

Endnotes

1. Philip K. Hitti, *History of the Arabs*, 10th ed. (New York: The Macmillan Press, 1974), 92.
2. A. J. Arberry, *Arabic Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1965), 4.
3. See Ahmed Y. Ghabin, "The Qur'anic Verses: A Source for Legitimacy or Illegitimacy of the Arts in Islam," *Der Islam* 75, no. 2 (1998): 193-94.
4. Thomas W. Arnold, *Painting in Islam: The Study of Pictorial Art in the Muslim Culture* (London: Dover Publications, 1965), 52.
5. *Ibid.*, 53-54.
6. Hassan al-Turabi, *Qaḍāyā al-Ḥurrīyah wa al-Waḥdah wa al-Shūrā wa al-Dimuqrāfiyah (Issues of Freedom, Unity, Consultation, and Democracy)* (Jeddah: Saudi House for Publication and Distribution, 1987), 87. Translations are ours.
7. *Ibid.*, 89.
8. *The Holy Qur'an: English Translation of the Meanings and Commentary* (Madinah: King Fahd's Holy Qur'an Printing Complex, 1410 ah), 407.
9. Al-Turabi, *Qaḍāyā*, 91.
10. *Ibid.*
11. *Ibid.*, 92.
12. *Ibid.*, 96.
13. Arnold, *Painting in Islam*, 2.
14. *Ibid.*, 4.
15. *Ibid.*, 9.
16. Al-Turabi, *Qaḍāyā*, 101.
17. *Ibid.*, 101-02.
18. *Ibid.*, 104-05.
19. *Ibid.*, 106.
20. *Ibid.*, 106-07.
21. *Ibid.*, 109.
22. *Ibid.*, 111-12.
23. *Ibid.*, 113.
24. *Ibid.*, 115-16.
25. *Ibid.*, 116-18.